



SDI FINAL EVALUATION FORM 1.1

PART 1:

Journal Name:	British Microbiology Research Journal
Manuscript Number:	2013_BMRJ_6433
Title of the Manuscript:	Prevalence and Molecular Diversity of <i>Legionella pneumophila</i> in Domestic Hot Water Systems of Private Houses

PART 2:

FINAL EVALUATOR'S comments on revised paper (if any)	Authors' response to final evaluator's comments
The revised version does not significantly answer the main concerns previously expressed : -the RAPD images and RAPD clustering procedure is not convincing -given the moderate number of strains, all patterns should be shown -contrary to what the authors are stating, no MLVA references have been included, the authors seem to have done no bibliographic research in this field -the authors need to admit that even when pattern producing assays have been used for a first quick analysis, these analyses have been complemented in the quoted literature by sequence analysis of at least one locus (mip, dotA etc) -if the authors are not equipped for sequence data production and analysis, then they need to search for collaborators. This is what collaborations are useful for (complement capacities).	- MLVA reference was added to the manuscript as advised by the reviewer [Ref. 21] “Sobral D, Le Cann P, Gerard A, Jarraud S, Lebeau B, Loisy-Hamon F, Vergnaud G, Pourcel C. High-throughput typing method to identify a non-outbreak-involved <i>Legionella pneumophila</i> strain colonizing the entire water supply system in the town of Rennes, France. Appl Environ Microbiol. 2011;77(19):6899-907” and the rest of the references were rearranged accordingly and highlighted in yellow inside the revised manuscript. - The RAPD images produced and RAPD clustering procedure was carried out using a software that has proven its credibility and has been used in a lot of published paper, with similar goals like ours: - a- Baddley JW, Pappas PG, Smith AC, Moser SA. Epidemiology of <i>Aspergillus terreus</i> at a university hospital. J Clin Microbiol. 2003 Dec;41(12):5525-9. - b- Rocha BA, Negro GM, Yamamoto L, Souza MV, Precioso AR, Okay TS. Identification and differentiation of Candida species from pediatric patients by random amplified polymorphic DNA. Rev Soc Bras Med Trop. 2008 Jan-Feb;41(1):1-5. - Although The authors agrees with the reviewer that the pattern produced in this study is used as a first quick analysis that needs further complemented sequence analysis studies, they also believe that such findings as described in this manuscript may be useful as baseline information and would be very much of interest especially to scientists in the field of Epidemiological Microbiology. It is important for the developing countries to publish their research activities on the global level, in order to find well equipped collaborate from the scientific community worldwide in order benefit from this research, which is the one of major aims of our work.